Health Equity Evaluation of a Partnership to Promote Healthy Environments: Results from a Formative Evaluation

MELANIE WARD*, AMY J. SCHULZ*, BARBARA A. ISRAEL*, KRISTINA L. RICE*, DONELE WILKINS**, ANGELA REYES*** ON BEHALF OF COMMUNITY ACTION TO PROMOTE HEALTHY ENVIRONMENTS (CAPHE)

*UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN SCHOOL OF PUBLIC HEALTH
**GREEN DOOR INITIATIVE
***DETROIT HISPANIC DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION

Funded by the National Institute of Environmental Health Sciences – Grant # RO1ES022616 and the Fred A. and Barbara M. Erb Family Foundation, with additional support from NIEHS through the M-LEEAD Core Center (#P30ES017885)
PRESENTER DISCLOSURES

Melanie Ward
The following personal financial relationships with commercial interests relevant to this presentation existed in the past twelve (12) months:

NO RELATIONSHIPS TO DISCLOSE
Agenda

• Equity promotion in CBPR partnerships
• Conceptual framework for evaluating equity promotion
• Case study: Community Action to Promote Healthy Environments
• Partnership activities and data collection
• Preliminary evaluation results
• Lessons learned

Funded by NIEHS Grant # RO1ES022616 and the Fred A and Barbara M. Erb Family Foundation with additional support from NIEHS Grant # P30ES017885
Equity Promotion in Community-Based Participatory Research

• Collaborative and **equitable** partnership in all phases of research and action

• Focus on problems relevant to local communities

• Ecological approaches to address multiple determinants of health

• Empowerment and power-sharing processes that attend to **social inequities**

Funded by NIEHS Grant # RO1ES022616 and the Fred A and Barbara M. Erb Family Foundation with additional support from NIEHS Grant # P30ES017885
Conceptual Framework for Evaluating Equity Promotion in CBPR Partnerships

Environmental Characteristics

Partner

Partnership Programs and Interventions

Intermediate Measures of Partnership Effectiveness and Equity
- Focus on equity within partnership processes
- Focus on addressing health equity
- Capacity and ability of communities facing health inequities to engage in future partnerships and decision-making
- Shift in power benefitting communities facing inequities

Long-term Outcome Measures of Partnership Effectiveness and Equity
- Reduced health inequities and inequities in the social and environmental determinants of health

Structural Characteristics

Group Dynamics Characteristics

Community Action to Promote Healthy Environments Partnership (CAPHE)

Contact: Kristina Rice, Project Manager, klrice@umich.edu
Air Quality in Detroit, Michigan

Playground next to Industrial Source in Delray, Detroit, MI

Funded by NIEHS Grant # RO1ES022616 and the Fred A and Barbara M. Erb Family Foundation with additional support from NIEHS Grant # P30ES017885
CAPHE’s Approach

• **Equitably** engage community and academic partners
• Increase knowledge about exposure to air pollution & health effects
• Translate findings into a public health action plan
• Implement innovative policy & practice solutions
• Build on community strengths
• **Formatively evaluate** process and impact

Funded by NIEHS Grant # RO1ES022616 and the Fred A and Barbara M. Erb Family Foundation with additional support from NIEHS Grant # P30ES017885
Partnership Activities and Data Collection

**Partnership Building and Research Activities**
- Introduce CBPR Principles
- Establish Group Norms
- Develop Dissemination Guidelines
- Conduct Research on Health Impacts

**Broader Community Engagement and Research Activities**
- Draft and Revise Mitigation Strategies
- Finalize Public Health Action Plan
- Meetings with Policymakers
- Conduct Research on Health Impacts

**Public Health Action Plan Implementation**
- Policy Education Trainings
- Disseminate Translational Materials
- Meetings with Policymakers

---

Wave 1 Questionnaire (2015)
Wave 2 Questionnaire (2017)
Field notes
Wave 3 Questionnaire (Late 2018)

Funded by NIEHS Grant # RO1ES022616 and the Fred A and Barbara M. Erb Family Foundation with additional support from NIEHS Grant # P30ES017885
### Example Metrics: Focus on Equity in Partnership Processes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Equity Metrics</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Issues analyzed are community identified and relevant</td>
<td>Processes, analyses, and activities are informed by communities facing inequity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Response to community concerns in action strategies and recommendations generated by the partnership</td>
<td>Processes or criteria to develop recommendations and strategies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of community knowledge and experience as evidence in analyzing equity impacts</td>
<td>Incorporation of community input or concerns in recommendations and strategies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Incorporation of community input in analyses of health impacts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Co-authorships and co-presentation of research projects</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Example Metrics: Focus on Equity in Partnership Processes

- **Funded by NIEHS Grant # RO1ES022616 and the Fred A and Barbara M. Erb Family Foundation with additional support from NIEHS Grant # P30ES017885**

Metrics adapted from Heller et al., 2014
### Questionnaire Results, Wave 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Steering Committee Questionnaire Items (2017)</th>
<th>Agree or Strongly Agree %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CAPHE partnership goals reflect a focus on equity.</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAPHE has been effective in forming relationships between diverse people and/or organizations.</td>
<td>94%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Through my participation in CAPHE, I have built relationships with individuals and/or organizations outside of my community.</td>
<td>94%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAPHE has developed common goals that are understood and supported by all partners.</td>
<td>94%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

n=17

Funded by NIEHS Grant # RO1ES022616 and the Fred A and Barbara M. Erb Family Foundation with additional support from NIEHS Grant # P30ES017885
### Questionnaire Results, Wave 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Steering Committee Questionnaire Items (2017)</th>
<th>Agree or Strongly Agree %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CAPHE's activities are informed by representatives from communities facing heightened health risk.</td>
<td>88%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAPHE’s activities aim to benefit communities facing heightened health risk</td>
<td>88%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAPHE has clearly communicated how its actions will address air quality and health inequities in Detroit</td>
<td>76%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAPHE has been effective in sharing information within Detroit about strategies to reduce adverse health effects</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*n=17*

Funded by NIEHS Grant # RO1ES022616 and the Fred A and Barbara M. Erb Family Foundation with additional support from NIEHS Grant # P30ES017885
Open-ended Items

- What do you hope CAPHE will accomplish in the following year?
- What recommendations do you have for how to strengthen CAPHE's work in Detroit?
- What suggestions do you have to facilitate CAPHE’s efforts to improve air quality in Detroit?
- What recommendations do you have for how to strengthen our partnership?
Themes

Wave 1
- Identify best practices to share with partners
- Formulate air pollution mitigation strategies
- Develop the Public Health Action Plan
- Share information to broader communities and decision-makers

Wave 2
- Raise awareness in Detroit about air quality and mitigation strategies
- Implement Public Health Action Plan recommendations successfully
- Further engaging community members and decision-makers
- Influence policy and policymakers

Funded by NIEHS Grant # RO1ES022616 and the Fred A and Barbara M. Erb Family Foundation with additional support from NIEHS Grant # P30ES017885
Selected Responses, Wave 2

Further engaging community members and decision-makers

“Reaching out to groups beyond the ‘usual suspects’ in community and EJ organizations in Detroit.”

“I believe we need to increase our focus on reaching community leaders who are not ‘at the table’ with us.”

“...I hope CAPHE will continue to present the Detroit public with resources to empower themselves, receive and respond to feedback from the public, and finalize...the living documents/drafts.”

Funded by NIEHS Grant # RO1ES022616 and the Fred A and Barbara M. Erb Family Foundation with additional support from NIEHS Grant # P30ES017885
Lessons Learned and Next Steps

• CAPHE goals and action strategies reflect a focus on promoting equity

• Community engagement and raising awareness are equity promotion priorities

• Findings promote reflection on equity in partnership processes and impacts

• Multiple data sources help to assess equity dimensions

Funded by NIEHS Grant # RO1ES022616 and the Fred A and Barbara M. Erb Family Foundation with additional support from NIEHS Grant # P30ES017885
Thank you to the CAPHE Core Team, Steering Committee & Public Health Action Planning Team, and to the representatives of all the organizations and agencies who provided input on the CAPHE Public Health Action Plan, with a special thank you to the environmental justice advocates and community members of Detroit.

Funded by NIEHS Grant # RO1ES022616 and the Fred A and Barbara M. Erb Family Foundation with additional support from NIEHS Grant # P30ES017885